

## International Panel for Sustainable Resource Management

### Third meeting of the Resource Panel

19-20 November 2008, Santa Barbara, USA

#### Meeting Highlights

The third meeting of the Resource Panel was held in Santa Barbara, USA, 19-20 November 2008. *Annex 1* provides a list of the participants.

#### **1. Opening**

Participants adopted the report of the previous meeting, held in Rome.

#### **2. Work Plan 2008 – 2009: Decoupling**

Ernst Ulrich von Weizsaecker presented the report on decoupling. He emphasised that decoupling cannot only be achieved through control and command and that current regulations are too limited to enforce effective decoupling. There is a need for a relative increase in resource prices to stir resource productivity. After a rich discussion it was concluded that the right balance needed to be found between private and public initiatives. The overall debate on economic regulation needed to be framed. It was underscored that the nexus between energy and water, metals and energy, and low hanging fruits should be addressed. Existing instruments needed to be reshaped. The role of low price, especially in the energy sector, is critical in this perspective. Price shocks would inflict social damages, but paying an adequate price for resource consumption is essential.

#### **3. Work Plan 2008 – 2009: Prioritisation**

Edgar Hertwich presented the main conclusions of the report. He underlined that there are few resource-oriented studies. He pointed out the difficulties to compare results due to differences in methods and approaches. The discussion led to the conclusion that prioritisation was of importance for decoupling policies. It was noted that LCA is a rewarding methodology, especially as many methodological issues have been resolved (for instance how to account for local impacts). It was recalled that the group is not supposed to carry out new research. Trade could be an interesting area to study in the perspective of the working group.

#### **4. Work Plan 2008 – 2009: Biofuels**

Stefan Bringezu presented the main conclusions of the report and the status of the activities of the related working group. Within the SCOPE Rapid Assessment Project a one week workshop was organised, attended by 40 international researchers amongst which 4 members of the Resource Panel working group on Biofuels. Amongst the main conclusions of the report are:

(a) in light of population growth and changing diets there will be more pressure on agricultural production, further enhanced by expected climate change impacts on yields. Given this situation, in the future we could face severe competition for land for food and fuel production; (b) biofuel

production can lead to GHG reductions by replacing fossil fuels, however, with current technologies reductions might be small or GHG emissions might even increase if lands storing carbon are converted; (c) different systems have different environmental impacts, and LCAs can help assess them; however LCA as a tool has also its limitations. After a vivid discussion Stefan concluded that there are trade offs between providing more clarity and including more data and shortening the report.

## **5. Work Plan 2008 – 2009: Metals**

Tom Graedel presented the report. He explained the important distinctions between stocks and flows of metals. He observed that the report focuses on in-use stocks, for which little data is available. He stressed that estimates are sometimes available but may not be reliable. He noted that a second report on recycling will be prepared. After some discussion he explained that Global Market Analysis could be done as well as some price modelling simulations. Tom stated that data exist on price volatility but give limited indication on trends. He pointed out that all reports are part of a sequence and policy recommendations should be set after the fourth report. He expressed his willingness to invite more people from the private industry in the future activities of the working group.

## **6. Work Plan 2008 – 2009: Water**

Ismail presented the report on water and observed that 50% of fresh water is already utilised. Per capita availability is declining. He further analysed the stakes and risks behind water mis-usages. After the discussion it was concluded that there was consensus on the need to develop a Terms of Reference for a possible water group, identifying the added value to the other topics and proposing a focus. Emphasis could be put on efficiency potentials (textile industry cities, precision farming). It was observed that it could be useful to have a short sub-chapter on issues that go beyond Panel scope (health), with cross references to existing publications (WHO).

## **7. Peer review and publication procedures**

Bas de Leeuw briefly highlighted the various steps of the Peer Review procedure that was drafted by the Secretariat. He recalled that the Terms of Reference of the Panel have been agreed on in Rome and that United Nations rules should apply on Panel publications as its funds are administrated by UNEP. He suggested that the existing document would be simplified and that the Secretariat would provide in addition a document on working arrangements for working groups and publications. This was agreed upon after a detailed and constructive review of the document by the Panel members.

## **8. Expertise mapping and additional experts**

Bas de Leeuw presented the outcome of the mapping exercise, emphasising the need for more economists and more experts from the private sector, especially from developing countries. The panel is requested to give its recommendations, while the appointment of new members should also be done in agreement with the Steering Committee. It was concluded that the experts proposed by the Secretariat could not be endorsed by the Panel at this stage. New names will be provided in the coming months.

## **9. Wrap up**

Ernst Ulrich von Weizsaecker presented the main recommendations and discussion points of the Panel meeting. On decoupling, he noted that ToR were met but there is an overall need for a clearer definition of decoupling. He observed that consideration of developing and developed countries

perspectives should be taken into consideration. Similarly, the analysis of policy mix with most important instruments for decoupling and the critical role of pricing mechanisms and resource productivity should be further studied.

On prioritisation, he pointed out that the ToR should be finalised. The activities of the Working Group are relevant for the assessment work of the Panel, providing facts and figures. The inter-linkages with the report on decoupling should be highlighted.

The overall feedback on biofuels was positive. The focus should remain on resource efficiency to ensure that this report adds value to the wealth of existing reports on biofuels. Trade-offs between different policy goals should be more emphasised. A section on key facts and messages could be useful for decision makers. The private sector audience should be taken into consideration in the recommendations of the report.

The report on metal flows meets the ToR. An introduction is needed to explain the flow of the 4 reports and their policy relevance. Mining and metal industries should be involved. The impacts from metal extraction and use on environment and indigenous people are to be considered in the 3rd report. Issue of critical metals for sustainable technologies are to be explored in addition.

First draft on water was welcomed as a starting point. ToR needs to be developed on the scope of a Panel report.

The peer review procedure should focus on peer review guidelines and the roles of SC and Secretariat should be clarified. Procedures should be shortened while internal guidelines for working groups are needed

Regarding the composition of the Panel, the need for new members was confirmed but names are yet to be identified. Panel members are invited to actively suggest names.

## **10. Joint session**

Sylvie Lemmet opened the joint session on behalf of UNEP and thanked everyone for their presence. She recalled that the Panel is independent and that its members do not represent any country or organisation. She also observed that the Panel has managed to reach its first objective, as each Working Group has produced a draft report of good quality within the requested delay.

As a co-chair of the Steering Committee, Timo Makela (EC) presented the agenda for approval. He invited the co-chairs of the Panel to present a summary of the recommendations of the Third Meeting of the Resource Panel on work plan.

Participants called for coherence between various reports. They mentioned that decoupling needs to be illustrated by biofuels and metals reports. They recommended that a synthesis/chapeau is drafted.

On decoupling, participants requested explicit attention for developing countries, for which decoupling is most urgent.

On prioritisation, they recalled that data availability is an issue, in particular for developing countries, and that policy relevance and next steps (like identifying a top ten of resources or product categories?) are not yet fully clear.



The first report on metals was welcomed by participants, as part of a sequence of several reports. They stressed that critical issues should be highlighted, in particular with regard to future projections and data collection. Questions of product design and alternatives need to be addressed as part of upcoming reports.

On biofuels, they stressed that a too negative tone should be avoided and that the added-value of this report should be more clearly identified given the existing literature. They insisted that the report would be complemented with case studies.

They remarked that the added value of work on water should be in the approach, which is to be integrated, system thinking, and using life cycle analysis.

A consensus was observed on the need for a short proposal on Peer Review. The mapping exercise on showed the need for economists and others. The ongoing work of the World Watch Institute was referred to as well as an upcoming workshop to be organised with the government of Japan, early in 2009.

## **11. Closing**

Ernst Ulrich von Weizsaecker thanked all participants and invited them to attend the next Panel meeting, to be held in June 2009.

## Annex 1

### International Panel for Sustainable Resource Management Resource Panel and Steering Committee meetings

Fess Parker's DoubleTree Resort  
19-21 November 2008  
Santa Barbara, USA

#### Participant list

#	Name	M/F	Country	Affiliation
<b>Resource Panel</b>				
1	Ernst Ulrich von Weizsäcker	M	Germany	Dean and Professor, Donald Bren School of Environmental Science and Management, University of California Santa Barbara
2	Ismail Serageldin	M	Egypt	Director, Library of Alexandria
3	Ashok Khosla	M	India	Founder & President, Development Alternatives Email: <a href="mailto:akhosla@devalt.org">akhosla@devalt.org</a> , <a href="mailto:akhosla@gmail.com">akhosla@gmail.com</a>
4	Stefan Bringezu	M	Germany	Director, Material Flows & Resource Management, Wuppertal Institute
5	Marina Fischer-Kowalski	F	Austria	Director, Institute of Social Ecology Faculty for Interdisciplinary Studies, University of Klagenfurt
6	Yvan Hardy	M	Canada	Former Chief Scientist of Natural Resources Canada
7	Edgar Hertwich	M	Norway	Professor, Dept. of Energy and Process Engineering, Norwegian University of Science and Technology
8	Lea Kauppi	F	Finland	Secretary General, Finnish Environment Institute
9	Yuichi Moriguchi	M	Japan	Director, Research Center for Material Cycles and Waste Management, National Institute for Environmental Studies
10	Anna-Bella Siriban-Manalang	F	Philippines	Director, Centre for Lean Systems, De La Salle University
11	Mark Swilling	M	South Africa	Professor, Sustainable Development Planning and Management, School of Public Management and Planning, University of Stellenbosch
12	Yong Ren	M	China	Deputy Director-General and Senior Research Fellow, Policy Research Center for Environment and Economy (PRCEE), Ministry of Environmental Protection

#	Name	M/F	Country	Affiliation
13	Jacqueline Aloisi de Larderel	F	France	Former Assistant Executive Director, UNEP
14	Thomas Graedel	M	USA	Professor, Industrial Ecology Yale School of Forestry & Environmental Studies
15	Jeff McNeely	M	USA	Chief Scientist, The World Conservation Union (IUCN)
16	David Stanners (for Jacqueline McGlade)	M	UK	European Environment Agency
<b>Apologies – Resource Panel</b>				
(-)	Jacqueline McGlade	F	UK	Executive Director, European Environment Agency
(-)	Sanit Aksornkoae	M	Thailand	President, Thailand Environment Institute (TEI)
(-)	Oleg Mitvol	M	Russia	Deputy Head, Federal Service for Supervision of Natural Resources Management
(-)	Robert Watson (Observer)	M	UK/USA	Professor, School of Environmental Sciences, University of East Anglia

#	Name	M/F	Country	Affiliation
<b>Steering Committee</b>				
17	Timo Makela	M	EC	Director, Sustainable Development and Integration, DG Environment
18	Antero Honkasalo	M	Finland	Director, Environmental Protection in Trade and Industry Ministry of the Environment
19	Stefanie Pfahl (for Ulf Dietmar Jaeckel)	F	Germany	Deputy Head, Product-related Environmental Protection, Resource Efficiency, Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety
21	Herman Sips	M	Netherlands	Senior Policy Coordinator, Ministry of Housing, Spatial Planning and the Environment
22	Mark J. Mwandosya	M	Tanzania	Minister for Water and Irrigation, Government of Tanzania
23	Hatem Mohamed	M	Egypt	Director, Directorate for International Environmental Policies Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency
25	Geoff Munro	M	Canada	Associate ADM and Chief Scientist, Natural Resources Canada
26	Hiroshi Fujita	M	Japan	Office of Sound Material-Cycle Society, Waste Management and Recycling Department, Ministry of the Environment
27	John H. Griffith (Observer)	M	USA	Office of Environmental Policy, Bureau of Oceans, Environment and Science (OES), US Department of State
28	Alejandro Posadas Urtusuastegui	M	Mexico	Embassy of Mexico
<b>Apologies – Steering Committee</b>				

#	Name	M/F	Country	Affiliation
(-)	<b>Paolo Soprano</b>	M	<b>Italy</b>	Head of Division for Sustainable Development, Directorate General for Development and Environmental Research, Ministry for the Environment, Land and Sea
(-)	<b>Vinny Pillay</b>	F	<b>South Africa</b>	Director, International Sustainable Development & Trade Co-operation, Department of Environmental Affairs & Tourism
(-)	<b>Pat Ockwell</b>	F	<b>Canada</b>	Counsellor, Science and Technology, Mission of Canada to the European Union
(-)	<b>Christian Averous (Observer)</b>	M	<b>OECD</b>	Head, Environmental Performance & Information Division OECD – Environment Directorate
(-)	<b>Jürg Gerber</b>	M	<b>WBCSD</b>	Chief Operating Officer World Business Council on Sustainable Development (WBCSD)
(-)	<b>Erzsébet Gergely</b>	F	<b>Hungary</b>	Deputy Director-General for Strategic Affairs Ministry of Environment and Water
(-)	<b>Terje Kronen</b>	M	<b>Norway</b>	Advisor, Ministry of Environment
(-)	<b>Leah Goldfarb</b>	F	<b>France</b>	Science Officer, International Council for Science (ICSU)
(-)	<b>Igor Maydanov</b>	M	<b>Russian Federation</b>	Director, Department for International Co-operation, Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment
(-)	<b>Bill Jackson</b>	M	<b>IUCN</b>	Global Programme Team (GPT), The World Conservation Union
(-)	<b>Zhang Jieqing</b>	F	<b>China</b>	Division Chief, International Organizations Division, Department of International Cooperation, Ministry of Environmental Protection
(-)	<b>Alice Cohen (Observer)</b>	F	<b>UK</b>	EU & International SCP Policy, Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (DEFRA)
(-)	<b>Stefan Schwager (Observer)</b>	M	<b>Switzerland</b>	Sector Manager Municipal and Construction Waste, Federal Office for the Environment
(-)	<b>John Matuszak (Observer)</b>	M	<b>USA</b>	Bureau of Oceans and International Environmental and Scientific Affairs, US Department of State
(-)	<b>Alvaro Zapag</b>	M	<b>Chile</b>	Executive Director, <i>La Comisión Nacional del Medio Ambiente</i>
(-)	<b>Liana Bratasida</b>	F	<b>Indonesia</b>	Assistant Minister for Global Environment Affairs and International Cooperation from Indonesia

Further participants				
<b>29</b>	<b>Werner Bosmans</b>	M	<b>EC</b>	Policy officer, Natural Resources Strategy, Sustainable Consumption & Production, DG Environment
<b>30</b>	<b>Pawel Kazmierczyk</b>	M	<b>EEA</b>	Project Manager, Sustainable Consumption and Production European Environment Agency

31	<b>Sylvie Lemmet</b>	F	<b>UNEP</b>	Director, Division of Technology, Industry and Economics, UNEP
32	<b>Arab Hoballah</b>	M	<b>UNEP</b>	Chief, Sustainable Consumption & Production, Division of Technology, Industry and Economics (DTIE), UNEP
33	<b>Bas de Leeuw</b>	M	<b>UNEP</b>	Head of Secretariat, International Panel for Sustainable Resource Management, Sustainable Consumption & Production, DTIE, UNEP
34	<b>Guido Sonnemann</b>	M	<b>UNEP</b>	Sustainable Consumption & Production Branch, DTIE, UNEP
35	<b>Martina Otto</b>	F	<b>UNEP</b>	Energy Branch, DTIE, UNEP
36	<b>Janet Salem</b>	F	<b>UNEP</b>	Sustainable Consumption & Production Branch, DTIE, UNEP
37	<b>Romain Perez</b>	M	<b>UNEP</b>	Sustainable Consumption & Production Branch, DTIE, UNEP