

**MINUTES OF THE THIRD MEETING OF THE INTERNATIONAL TASK FORCE ON
SUSTAINABLE TOURISM DEVELOPMENT
10-12 DECEMBER 2007**

The Third International Task Force Meeting on Sustainable Tourism Development (ITF-STD) was held on 10-12 December, 2007 at the Centre de Conférences International in Paris, France. The meeting was organized by the French Ministry for Ecology, Sustainable Development and Spatial Planning; the French Ministry of European and Foreign Affairs; the French Ministry in charge of Tourism and the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) with the support of the Norwegian Government. Approximately 86 participants attended the meeting, including 12 country members, 9 international organizations, 9 federal associations together with NGOs, and 18 participating experts.

The objectives of the meeting were to:

- Review the current challenges related to the financing of sustainable tourism development and exploring opportunities and strengthening partnerships with multi-lateral and bilateral financing institutions and donors;
- Explore the possibility of establishing a standardized set of operational criteria for financing sustainable tourism projects that would be adhered to by donors;
- Review the National and/ or Regional Strategic Approaches on Sustainable Tourism Development;
- Review the programme of work and the thematic areas of priority with a goal towards identifying the policy tools that are needed at a national level to maximize the coordination necessary to achieve STD;
- Take stock of developments during the Second ITF-STD Meeting- particularly with respect to the programme of work; and
- Review the scope of the 10-year framework programme (10YFP) to reflect on the policy recommendations that could be submitted under the framework for Sustainable Consumption and Production (SCP) that will be negotiated at the UN CSD in 2010/2011.

The meeting was chaired by Mr. Christian Brodhag, the French inter-ministerial Delegate for Sustainable Development that also stated that the ITF-STD work shall result in important contributions to the Marrakech Process that will be up for policy review and recommendations in the 2010-2011 cycle of the United Nations Commission on Sustainable Development (CSD).

A major achievement of the Task Force during this meeting included the organization of a back to back workshop which focused on sustainable investment and financing in the tourism sector and attracted the interest of financial institutes aiming at mainstreaming sustainability principles into tourism investments and projects. The workshop suggested the establishment of a network comprising financial stakeholders, private investors, international organisations and developing destinations that will focus on the mainstreaming of sustainable principles on investments and development projects in the tourism sector. The network will be called SIFT Network (Sustainable Investment and Financing in Tourism). Beside the Task Force members the world Bank, the GEF, the IFC, the UN foundation, the US Overseas Private Investment Corporation, commercial banks and Private Equity corporations have agreed to participate in the network in order to build ties with destinations in developing countries and develop guidelines for sustainable investments in the tourism sector.

The use of this initiative was considered as an opportunity for the following:

- Creating a network on Sustainable Investment and Financing in Tourism with the participation of multi-lateral and bi-lateral donors, financing institutions, the private sector (banks, tourism

- companies, and investors), developing countries and international organisations.
- Providing guidance to financing institutes, private investors and public authorities at national and local levels in constructing the appropriate policy frameworks to complement and stimulate the channeling of financial resources necessary for sustainable tourism development.

The preliminary conclusions presented at the meeting highlighted that the work of the ITF-STD in developing pilot projects, networking, and developing tools serve in a very good way the main objective of the Marrakech process, which is the promotion of sustainable consumption and production through concrete actions.

The meeting proved that the Task Force has started to deliver concrete outputs towards the development of sustainable consumption and production patterns in the tourism value chain. These outputs are related with the projects financed by the French Ministry (communication campaign, guidelines for tourism in coastal zones, training material for hospitality schools) but have also contributed to projects that started within the Task Force's programme of work and implemented by various partners.

The meeting also addressed responsible investment and financing as a corner stone for sustainable tourism development. The participation of financing agencies and donors in this meeting created a good momentum for match-making between "financial sources" and "development demands" in the tourism sector under a framework of sustainable development.

The list of participants, the meeting agenda, a copy of key note speeches are attached in Annexes. The presentations delivered at the meeting are accessible online at www.veilletourisme.fr

Annex I- List of Participants

Annex II- The Meeting Agenda

Annex III- Key note speech by Ms. Nathalie Kosciusko-Morizet, French Secretary of State for Ecology

Annex IV-Key note speech by Mr. Carlos Benavides, Minister for Tourism in Costa Rica

Annex V- Closing speech by Mr. Luc Chatel, French Secretary of State for Consumer Affairs and Tourism

OPENING OF THE TASK FORCE MEETING

The meeting was opened by Ms. Nathalie Kosciusko-Morizet, French Secretary of State for Ecology who expressed her gratitude to the organizers of the event including to the Norwegian Government that provided financial support to sponsor participating delegates from developing countries. The Secretary of State congratulated the ITF-STD for its involvement in promoting sustainable consumption and production patterns in the tourism industry during the past two years. She highlighted the importance of the ITF-STD recommendations at the UN CSD meeting taking place in 2010/2011. She stressed the importance of the third meeting to further discuss the progress of the programme of work and to reflect on the policy tools to be implemented to achieve sustainable tourism development at a national level.

WORKSHOP ON FINANCING AND SUSTAINABLE TOURISM DEVELOPMENT

The ITF-STD has been conscious of the need to respond to the requests of the developing and least developed countries (LDCs) for improving tourism infrastructure, as an integral component to the development of these countries. To this end, the meeting was an opportunity to engage with multilateral and bilateral financing institutions and donors on:

- Reviewing the current challenges on financing sustainable tourism development;
- Sharing the experiences of financing institutions, development agencies and countries to evaluate the density of tourism projects present in the portfolios; and
- Evaluating the feasibility and usefulness of an initiative to consolidate and further strengthen a framework for sustainable investment and financing in the tourism sector.

The workshop on Financing and Sustainable Tourism Development was divided into three sessions.

SESSION 1 INTRODUCTION AND OBJECTIVES:

Mr. Brodhag presented the general scope of the workshop and encouraged the ITF-STD members to focus on the contribution towards promoting sustainable tourism and sustainable consumption and production (SCP) patterns by the work performed to date. He reminded the need to move towards policy recommendations with the objective of contributing to the Marrakech process.

Mr. Charles Arden Clarke, Head of the Goods and Service Unit at UNEP/DTIE gave a presentation explaining the context of the 10YFP in which the ITF-STD's role is to contribute to its delivery with the aim of supporting regional and national initiatives to accelerate the shift towards SCP and to support its implementation beyond 2011.

The main priorities proposed included engaging the development agencies in a strong dialogue of cooperation regarding SCP activities to alleviate poverty as part of the Marrakech process.

Mr. Luigi Cabrini, Director of UNWTO's Sustainable Tourism Department, gave a presentation emphasizing the importance of tourism as a strong economic sector by presenting the main indicators of growth. The key points made in the presentation were that:

- The expansion of the tourism industry must be recognized and the principles of sustainable tourism must be applied to achieve sustainable tourism development.
- The tourism sector is extremely resilient in responding to crisis but climate change is an emerging threat that must be integrated in the sustainability agenda. To this end,
- There is a need to address the relationship between tourism and climate change in order to develop tools for the tourism sector to adapt to climate change.
- The importance of providing financial institutions with the necessary background and tools in order to incorporate them as partners towards the drive to sustainable tourism development.

Mr. Stefanos Fotiou, Tourism and Environment Programme Officer at UNEP/DTIE gave a presentation on sustainable financing entitled: Current Trends and Challenges for the Tourism Sector. He explained the concept of the workshop on sustainable financing for tourism and presented an overview of the UNEP Finance Initiative (UNEP FI) to highlight lessons and messages related to the relationship between the investment and financial sectors and sustainability. He also presented the investment and financing challenges for the tourism sector, highlighting that tourism is a crucial source for foreign exchange in Least Developed Countries (LDCs) and ranked as a high priority for investment by promotion agencies in developing countries; and to this end there is a clear need to focus on financing tourism projects that will contribute to poverty alleviation, and natural and cultural conservation.

The following key figures were presented to highlight the importance of tourism development:

- The tourism industry is a 1 US\$ trillion industry employing about 230 million.
- It is an important source of investment in developing countries such as in:
 - Namibia -13% of total investments
 - India (Kerala) -8% of total investments
 - China - 9.9% of total investments
 - Malaysia -12% of total investments
 - The Caribbean- 15%-76% of total investments
- The industry represents 9.5% of global total investments. More than 1.15 trillion US\$. (3 years average; 2004-2006)

(Source for all figures: WTTC)

The impact of tourism on growth shows that:

- Tourism represents up to 40% of GDP in DC and LDCs, with statistical extremes going up to 66% *(Source: UNWTO)*;
- Tourism represents 33% of global “trade in services” *(Source: WTO)*;
- Tourism can employ unskilled or semi-skilled labour and in outlying areas *(Source:OECD)*;
- Virtually all LDCs are tourism net exporters *(Sources: UNWTO, WTO, WTTC)*;
- “Mass leisure tourism” is unlikely to considerably alleviate poverty *(Source:UNWTO)*.

Some main issues raised included the importance of:

- Incorporating overarching principles in criteria to apply it to any sector and to assure that financed projects will ensure a minimum level of sustainability.
- Practicing best environmental, social, and financial practices consistent with fiduciary principles.
- Showcasing case studies demonstrating that caring for sustainability can be a profitable business.
- Defining how multi-lateral, bilateral donors and financial institutions can address the sustainability aspects of tourism development activities they support;
- Recognizing that institutions support tourism activities directly or as a component under a full scale project imbedded in biodiversity-nature conservation to avoid missing project opportunities; and
- Defining substantive standards that the institutions can apply to address priorities and steps on how they can implement them and assure compliance.

With regards to the specific role of the financing sector, the need to address environmental and social issues in the project portfolio management was considered critical for developing transparency and credibility in the sector. Monitoring and evaluation criteria were considered essential to establish more responsible investments in the tourism sector.

SESSION 2- PRESENTATIONS BY MULTILATERAL AND BILATERAL INSTITUTIONS AND DONORS ON SUSTAINABILITY ISSUES IN FINANCING TOURISM DEVELOPMENT

Ms. Karla Chaman Ruiz, Communication Officer, Development and Communication Division, and Ms. Christianna Johnnides, Cultural Heritage Thematic Group of the World Bank Group (WB) provided background information on The WB's Experience with Cultural Heritage and Sustainable Tourism. Together they highlighted why cultural heritage is connected with sustainable tourism and outlined the criteria used by the WB to evaluate project proposals. They also showcased successful projects. They mentioned some emerging trends and themes that the WB has experienced through project management and proposed areas of work where synergies could be made between the WB and the ITF-STD.

They said that the WB acknowledges cultural heritage and sustainable tourism as an area of priority for investment due to its capacity to build revenue generating assets that in turn support economic development and poverty alleviation. These two components are imbedded in multi-sectoral projects and activities.

They explained that the WB portfolio has shifted towards investments that facilitate tourism development and that the approach taken reflects that the improvement of physical planning can achieve positive economic conditions.

They mentioned that areas of work could be established between the WB and the ITF-STD to create synergies, further consolidate, and strengthen operational criteria for the financing of sustainable tourism. These included:

- The development of policy tools in various sectors through knowledge of multi-sector policy frameworks;
- The active participation of the WB in the climate change agenda;
- The development of communication strategies applied to difficult environments; and
- The implementation of capacity building in different areas (ie. procurement, technical, governance and communication)

The second presentation was delivered by Ms. Nicole Glineur, Program Manager for Biodiversity and Private Sector, The Global Environment Fund (GEF). Ms. Glineur mentioned that GEF provides grants for the incremental costs of achieving Global Environmental Benefits in support of sustainable development in 6 focal areas: biological diversity, climate change, international waters, land degradation, ozone layer depletion and persistent organic pollutants (POPs).

Ms. Glineur listed the operational principles applied by GEF and noted other principles used by the implementing agencies. She also mentioned that monitoring and evaluation is achieved by GEF and the implementing agencies through the enforcement of regulations.

Mr. Martin Tampe, Senior Expert in Tourism and Environment and Natural Resource Management representing the German Agency for Technical Cooperation (GTZ) presented the activities undertaken by Germany to develop sustainable tourism. He outlined the instruments that GTZ uses to provide development assistance and presented the portfolio, highlighting the tourism project called Sustainable Tourism Products in Latin America (LA).

Ms. Ellen Svendsen, Higher Executive Officer, Section of the Environment and Sustainable Development from the Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Mr. Paul Hofseth, Senior Advisor, Norwegian Ministry of Environment presented the Norwegian Policy document on

development cooperation. Ms. Svendsen noted that climate change and biodiversity are highlighted as areas of priority in the Norwegian action plan for environment in development cooperation. She presented a specific project relevant to the discussion on setting up a general set of operational criteria for implementing tourism projects. She stated that Norway is funding a project led by Nordic World Heritage that aims at identifying existing knowledge and successful model projects and examines how it can be transferred in a South-South perspective. On this basis, guidelines will be gathered on how to achieve effective tourism projects.

Mr. Hofseth announced a new initiative by the Minister of Environment and Development Affairs, which aims at producing a policy report to parliament on how Norwegian companies behave abroad. It will focus on corporate social responsibility (CSR) and touch upon issues concerning the production of goods and services by the Norwegian government abroad, sustainable procurement of goods and services abroad and the effect of investments portfolio choices and strategies for partnership. In light of the workshops aim, he said that through this process there is strong interest from Norway in providing advice to the private sector coupled with OECD, UN, and the World Business Council (WBC) guidelines to produce a report that will also have an effect on the tourism sector.

Mr. Herve Gallepe, Responsible for providing support to the Private Sector (PS) at the French Agency for Development (AFD), presented the experience of the AFD in Sustainable Tourism.

He presented the AFD tourism development project portfolio that includes:

- The intervention of AFD in the tourism sector through the financing of sectoral projects that are cross cutting with tourism;
- The financing of economic operators in the tourism supply chain (i.e. Hotels);
- Local capacity building to support ecotourism development, hotel operations and energy efficiency projects in hotels; and
- The promotion of tourism in foreign tourism markets through the reinforcement of the image and competitiveness of a destination, achieved through consultation with international experts, providing technical support and institutional support to governments to handle their own priorities.
- The projects assist local authorities in the development of sustainable tourism

Ms. Florence Lauger, International Financing Manager at the Entreprise Rhones Alpes International (ERAI), introduced ERAI which aims to develop agencies in developing countries to provide support around the world. She mentioned that the agency plays a key role in assisting small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) located abroad in understanding procedures set by financial institutions and donors, on how to respond to call for bids and on how to submit an application for funding.

SESSION 3: SHAPING A SET OF CRITERIA FOR FINANCING SUSTAINABLE TOURISM

Mr. Cabrini (UNWTO) provided an overview of the 12 UNEP-UNWTO aims for sustainable tourism. He explained that these aims can be accomplished by applying sustainability indicators to existing instruments for making tourism more sustainable to measure results and to assure better management. He said these indicators can be used by multi lateral and bilateral financing institutions and donors when they are evaluating tourism development proposals.

Main challenges highlighted by the key note speakers to mainstream sustainability issues in financing tourism development included:

- The need to further develop policy tools for sustainable tourism development in LDCs;
- The need to work with the local authorities to increase their understanding of sustainable tourism development;
- The need to ensure local economic growth and local capacity building;
- The challenges posed by funding allocation because of the cross cutting nature of tourism;
- The need to implement effective communication strategies targeting behavioral change amongst consumers;
- The need to set clear operational guidelines from existing information on sustainable tourism;
- The need to have a multi-sectoral approach in the project cycle;
- The need to consider broad regional development;
- The need to practice a two way communication approach to lay the foundation for sustainable development; and
- The need to build a capacity at a local level to achieve institutional development; the failure to do so is considered a risk factor in the projects.

Mr. Fotiou (UNEP/DTIE) presented a framework for Sustainable Investment and Financing in the Tourism Sector (SIFT), which aims to evaluate the feasibility and usefulness of an initiative to consolidate and further strengthen a framework for sustainable investment and financing in the tourism sector. The framework considered the life cycle approach of a tourism development project. He explained the potential role of the financial institutions in the SIFT framework under each phase and the potential application of existing tools to assess the sustainability of the project throughout the cycle.

Based on the evaluation of the SIFT framework, Mr. Fotiou proposed the development of an operational handbook on 'Sustainable Investment and Financing in the Tourism Sector for financial institutions.

The discussion focused on the following key issues:

- The opportunity to set up a general set of operational criteria that would be harmonized amongst the donors
 - The participants representing the WB expressed interest in supporting the SIFT initiative. They stressed that monitoring and evaluation of sustainable tourism projects is an area of weakness. In this context, they considered the initiative as an opportunity to define criteria that will further shape financial institution policies.
 - Some country members of the ITF-STD communicated interest in the initiative because tourism is an important industry in their countries recognized by foreign investors. The participants pointed out the need to harmonize the procedures between financial institutions and donors for financing sustainable tourism projects to help simplify the procedures for countries to apply for funding.
 - The NGOs expressed their willingness to support the initiative as well.
- Recommendations on how to define such criteria that would be operational and useful for donors were suggested and included:
 - Mapping out the existing tools and guidelines that already exist, that can support more sustainable investments and financing in the tourism sector and to filter and adapt them according to the needs of the tourism sector and developing countries;
 - Collecting baseline data from a number of sustainable tourism projects to identify the results of a successful triple bottom line approach;
 - Evaluating the implementation of existing tools on the ground to assess if changes or amendments are needed;

- Outlining the responsibilities of the different actors involved in sustaining a tourism project;
- Defining criteria for investment by using globally relevant data that already exists, such as species data that will allow the comparison of investment in different countries through bio-specific related data;
- Considering developing criteria that can be applied to the destination and to the authenticity of a country;
- Identifying a territorial approach in developing the criteria and a methodology that integrates the local community; and
- Maximizing synergies with other UN agencies through the United Nations Tourism Exchange Network (UNTEN), for example, in support of this initiative.
- Challenges to consolidating and further strengthening a framework for sustainable investment and financing in the tourism sector were identified; namely:
 - The need to provide training and technical assistance for the implementation of the tools at a local level;
 - The lack of private sector involvement to measure, gather and analyze the implementation of the tools;
 - The lack of funding to finance technology for tracking systems monitoring the implementation of existing tools;
 - The lack of local cooperation in the capacity to gathering and analyses of data; and
 - The need to assure ownership of sustainable tourism projects by the donors.

Mr. Brodhag closed the session recalling that the conservation of biodiversity, one of the main assets of tourism development, should be a primary focus of any tourism project and investment. He stressed the need to synergize tourism policies with the global approach to sustainable tourism development. In this respect, he emphasized the need to strengthen coherence between the sustainable tourism strategies and other overarching strategies on global issues, such as poverty alleviation, targeted in strategies at national, regional, and local level.

DAY TWO

SESSION 1: NATIONAL AND/OR REGIONAL STRATEGIC APPROACHES ON SUSTAINABLE TOURISM DEVELOPMENT

Mr. Paul Hofseth, Senior Advisor, Norwegian Ministry of Environment co-chaired this session. Presentations were delivered by OECD and ITF-STD country members that focused on the national and/or regional strategic approaches on sustainable tourism development implemented by different countries. This was followed by a question and answer session.

Mr. Alain Dupeyras, Head of the Tourism Programme at OECD reported some key findings on strategic approaches to sustainable tourism that have been taken by various OECD countries. This report is yet to be published.

The following findings were presented:

- Most OECD countries have applied national sustainable development strategies to a number of sectors, including tourism;
- Most OECD countries have a tourism strategy with specific actions in priority areas (ie. biodiversity, awareness raising, sustainability of products); and
- Some OECD countries target specific actions and tools for the development of tourism.

He underlined that a wide range of approaches have been taken by OECD countries that shows a real awareness amongst these countries of the need to have a clear strategic vision for a sustainable tourism development.

Following this presentation, twelve country presentations were delivered by the Bahamas, Cambodia, Cap Vert, China, Croatia, Madagascar, Norway, Mali, Morocco, SICA, Brazil and Costa Rica. (Brazil, Costa Rica and Norway delivered their presentations on the third meeting day but the presentation discussion will be incorporated in this section). They presented on the strategic frameworks and tools developed and implemented in their countries and underpinning their action plans for sustainable tourism development. (Power point presentations are available online at www.veilletourisme.fr)

The key areas of priority addressed in the strategic frameworks for sustainable tourism development focused on:

• Culture and Natural Heritage	• Transition from mass to quality growth of tourism	• Local development coupled with environmental management	• Capacity Building in the tourism industry
• Climate Change	• Protection of Coastal Areas	• Tourism for solidarity	• Airline industry
• Poverty alleviation	• Governance	• Development of tourism products	• Marketing of the destinations
• Institutional organization focused on cooperation between government and the service sector			

The main lead and supporting actors involved in the development and implementation of the strategic framework for sustainable tourism development were highlighted as being:

- The Ministry of Tourism with the engagement of the private sector;
- The Ministry of Environment with the involvement of the local population and the Ministry of Transport and the Ministry of Culture;
- The Ministry of Trade and Industry;
- Ministries which are building cooperation with international organizations to focus on sustainable destination management; and
- National Task Forces organized in some countries with the involvement of representatives from the health, education, environment, infrastructure ministerial departments.

Key concerns affecting sustainable tourism were addressed by the participants to discuss the measures that countries have taken within their strategic framework. These are presented in the table below:

Concerns	Measures taken
• Climate change	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • France's commitment to the 'Grenelle de l'Environnement'. The series of political meetings were held in France in October 2007 to negotiate long-term decisions regarding the environment and sustainable development. The dialogues engaged multi-stakeholders. • Awareness raising programs and symposiums on climate change and adaptation strategies targeting developers and investors • Capacity building and education on adaptation and mitigation mechanisms in tourism • Political commitments to become carbon

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reversing trends • Large Scale Real Estate Investment Guidance • Leakages and local development 	<p style="text-align: center;">neutral</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Compensation of CO2 emissions by government officials • National strategy on climate change that targets several sectors including tourism • Mapping strategies to balance economic development and social well being with environmental protection • Educating stakeholders who will have the capacity to advise the government with the power of vote with the aim of changing legislation that affects real estate decisions • Development of agro-tourism benefiting rural local communities
---	---

The key challenges experienced by the countries within the different frameworks include:

- The need for measures to diversify tourism to other areas through community based tourism;
- The need for measures to manage sustainable mobility;
- The need to attract local foreign investment;
- The need for prevention measures against sexual exploitation in tourism destinations, to abate land pressure, to control the displacement of people due to tourism activities and to control deforestation;
- The need for timely planning to forecast tourism boom;
- The need to compromise the conflicting strategies between Real Estate investors and the tourism strategies set in place;
- The need for defined guidelines and strategies to stimulate sustainable tourism;
- The need for tools and capacity building on resource management in the industry; and
- The lack of indicators to measure tourism impacts on natural resources.

SESSION 2: IMPLEMENTATION OF THE TASK FORCE’S PROGRAMME OF WORK
PARALLEL SESSION 1: POLICY TOOLS AND GOOD PRACTICES

The session was moderated by Mr. Xavier Alphaize, Executive Secretary for the Task Force on Sustainable Tourism Development in UNCTAD.

FIRST PRESENTATION- IMPLEMENTATION OF SUSTAINABLE TOURISM PROJECTS IN LDCs :

Mr. Alphaize presented the UNCTAD TrainForTrade distance learning program launched within the UNCTAD e-tourism initiative. He explained that it provides capacity building which targets the public sector in LDCs. He said it provides access to sustainable tourism development related knowledge, opportunities to apply and adapt it to local conditions with the objective of defining and elaborating an action plan and a medium term project consistent with the local National or Regional Tourism Strategy. He presented the capacity building cycle of the seminar and the implementation of the program after the cycle.

The discussion focused on the experience of participating LDCs on the usefulness of the seminar. The following issues were raised:

- The need to offer the seminar to other administrative officials that have influence over tourism administration decisions;
- The need to offer the seminar to private operators in the tourism sector;
- The need to complement the seminar with a face to face seminar;
- The need to translate the pedagogical material into other languages;
- The need to implement an action plan on sustainable tourism development based on the commitments set forth at the end of the training seminar;
- The need to follow up on the implementation of the project to assure the added value provided to users;
- The importance of establishing a link between the national authority and the local activities within the formation cycle to address poverty alleviation; and
- The importance of establishing a regional cooperation and consultation process between the beneficiary countries to exchange experiences.

SECOND PRESENTATION- DECENTRALIZED COOPERATION:

Mr. Jean Claude Mairal, Vice-President of the Auvergne Region gave a brief presentation on decentralized cooperation as a strategy to catalyze synergies between public and private actors in the tourism sector in a single territory to achieve sustainable tourism development. He highlighted the importance of this cooperation in fostering community participation and in developing tourism activities based on the land use planning needs. He also mentioned that it is a strategy used to create a territorial institutional framework that safeguards the local culture.

THIRD PRESENTATION- LOCAL GOVERNANCE AND DECENTRALIZED COOPERATION:

Mr. Jean-Pierre Martinetti, Director of the Tourism Development Agency in Alpes de Haute-Provence gave a presentation on local governance as a strategy for sustainable tourism development. He gave an overview of two initiatives. The first highlighted a pioneer project that takes a territorial approach to sustainable tourism through the implementation of local agenda 21. The second provided an overview of 'la Cite de la Culture et du Tourism Durable'. He said that this initiative is a multidisciplinary platform that provides training and access to a resource center on local cultural heritage. It is an international network of tools to achieve transnational decentralized cooperation with the aim of supporting cooperation between actors and the territory to achieve sustainable tourism development.

The discussion after the presentation highlighted that:

- Public - private partnership is needed to coordinate the activities within the 'Cite de la Culture et du Tourism Durable' initiative; and
- Regional cooperation is essential to achieve a territorial approach to sustainable tourism development combined with public private partnership

FOURTH PRESENTATION- SUSTAINABLE TOURISM: THE ICZM APPROACH:

Ms. Željka Škaričić, Programme Officer at PAP/RAC presented the methodological manual for sustainable coastal tourism development: the ICZM approach that was developed in partnership with UNEP and PAP/RAC under the ITF-STD programme of work. The methodology explained in the manual will be implemented in the pilot destination of Baška Voda near Split (Croatia). The pilot project will involve the local authorities as well as all other major stakeholders, including the general public.

The discussion after the presentation raised the following questions:

- The relationship of the manual to the EC integrated Coastal Zone Management Approach;

- The use of the manual at the community level or at the management level; and
- The link between the Blue Flag initiative and the criteria used in the methodology.

In response to the questions, the following points were made:

- The manual is in line with EU recommendations;
- The manual will be used by a University as a main training tool for postgraduate training in tourism;
- The manual will be used by UNEP as a main tool for coastal zone management and will eventually be translated into French; and
- A second pilot phase is expected to take place in the Caribbean and SE Asia with the intention of using it as a global manual

PARRALLEL SESSION 2: STRATEGIES; CSER; GOVERNANCE
FIRST PRESENTATION- CAPACITY BUILDING, INFORMATION AND NETWORKING:

Ms. Catalina Etcheverry, Consultant at UNEP/ DTIE and Mrs. Helena Rey de Assis, Associate Programme Officer in the Tourism Programme at UNEP/DTIE presented the progress that has been made with three capacity building projects.

The first presentation gave an update on the revising and updating of the environmental and sustainable tourism teaching pack: Sowing the Seeds of Change. The revised version has undergone two peer reviews; the teaching pack is complemented by a range of tools and related material to support hospitality teachers with the integration of the topic in their education curricula and hospitality professionals with the knowledge and the practical tools to implement sustainable tourism and resource management in hotel operations. The proposal for the design and layout of the CD-ROM was presented together with the navigation phases. The CD-ROM is expected to be disseminated through partnering hospitality associations in February 2008. The teaching pack will be translated into French.

The second project coordinated by UNEP in cooperation with ADEME on capacity building for environmental management of small and medium enterprises in the accommodation sector remains a work in progress. To date, Madagascar and Vietnam have been selected as pilot countries for project implementation. An assessment study on the current needs and capacities of the SMEs in the accommodation sector in each country is currently being developed to provide baseline information. This study will be used as input for the development of the e-tool for environmental management.

Finally, the development of the Green Passport Campaign being implemented by UNEP in cooperation with the Brazilian Ministries of Tourism and Environment and with the support of key tourism organizations was presented. Mrs. Rey de Assis mentioned that the project has two phases, one that is the development of a global campaign on responsible holidays, and the second phase is the validation of this campaign at one tourism destination. The Green Passport website as well as communication materials directed to tourists will be developed initially in three languages (English, French, and Spanish). The main content of the website has been developed and the structure has been validated by the partners and communication experts. The content will be edited to provide tips on responsible tourism behavior by providing an overall positive message. She announced that Paraty, Brazil was selected as the pilot destination to implement the campaign due to the convergence of interest and existing activities in that area. This pilot project will be supported by a political agenda that has been agreed on by the municipality with the federal government to formalize the project implementation.

The discussion raised the following issues:

- The identification of synergies for the dissemination of the projects and for the replication of the material included in the Green Passport Campaign; and
- The identification of launching events for the Teaching Pack and for the Green Passport Campaign.

Some major launching events and partnerships were suggested as follows:

- ITB Berlin in 5-9 March 2008 was suggested as a launching event for the Teaching Pack;
- The World Conservation Congress (IUCN) in Barcelona 5-14 October 2008 was suggested as a launching event for the Green Passport Campaign;
- UNESCO World Heritage Center is seeking partnerships for a project on capacity building for the monitoring and management of world sites; and
- Desti-net was identified as a useful information sharing platform to disseminate information on the projects.

SECOND PRESENTATION- DESTINATION MANAGEMENT :

Mr. Alfred Schumm, Director of the Global Marine Tourism Approach at WWF Germany presented the progress of the activities under the WWF/TOI partnership that aims at improving the environmental management of marine and coastal areas. Since the pilot testing of the partnership in Lastovo Island, there was a launching event in Split, Croatia. The partnership cooperated with the Croatian Government on declaring Lastovo Archipelago as an official protected area. The partnership further established Lastovo as a Nature Park; a tourism steering committee has been organized to initiate a strategic tourism plan and TOI has provided assistance in setting up an incoming agency by in-house training. Future projects under development were mentioned and the project goals were underlined as follows:

- The adoption of good environmental practices by TOI hotel suppliers;
- The integration and adoption of sustainable siting, design and construction practices in federal regulations; and
- Focus on the tourists' contribution to natural protected areas.

The discussion raised the following issues:

- The need to identify opportunities for financing;
- The need to protect existing areas and new protected areas with the assistance of local authorities;
- The importance of education in making the implementation of tools such as the WWF tool kit meaningful;
- The suggestion of world heritage site managers as key partner in creating an arena within the national government sector; and
- The importance of involving Tour Operators that can provide solutions from the industry side.

THIRD PRESENTATION- LABELS, STANDARDS AND CERTIFICATION PROCESSES :

Mr. Ronald Sanabria, Sustainable Tourism Director at Rainforest Alliance (RA) presented the Sustainable Tourism Baseline Criteria Initiative. RA is preparing an international comparison of sustainable tourism standards in cooperation with UNEP, IUCN, ECOTRANS, UNF and other ITF-STD members. It aims at developing baseline criteria for sustainable tourism to assist different stakeholders. Since the last task force meeting, 4,500 criteria have been collected and reviewed; a small set of criteria with common elements has been defined and RA has embarked on a consultation process that has refined the criterion.

The next steps of the project were presented as follows:

- Additional comments were expected until January 30th;
- A private sector consultation will be hosted by UN Foundation to comment on the results of the criteria;
- Further consultation will take place until the outcomes are presented at the World Conservation Congress in Barcelona 5-14 October 2008; and
- Private sector cooperation will be sought to participate in the consultation process.

Some members of the ITF-STD raised the fact that the criteria is not a stand alone tool, and capacity building should be developed to implement the criteria at the local level.

FOURTH PRESENTATION- THE ST-EP PROGRAMME:

Mr. Luigi Cabrini, UNWTO, presented the Sustainable Tourism for the Elimination of Poverty Initiative (ST-EP) that was launched in 2002. He provided an overview of the research activities UNWTO has undertaken to develop four reports. These provide evidence on the impact of tourism in contributing to poverty alleviation and recommendations on how to minimize the negative impacts of tourism. The STEP project has 51 pilot projects under implementation benefiting LDCs.

FIFTH PRESENTATION- INTERNATIONAL YEAR OF THE REEF:

Mrs. Genevieve Verbrugge, Consultant at UNEP, gave a presentation on the International Year of the Reef (IYOR) in 2008 to encourage ITF-STD member countries and organizations to develop IYOR activities in their region in support of the International Coral Reef Initiative (ICRI) campaign. She explained that IYOR 2008 will (1) raise awareness about the value and importance of coral reefs and threats to their survival and (2) motivate people to take action to protect coral reefs. The campaign is expected to consist of a wide range of events and activities that will take place throughout 2008. There are approximately 50 focal points that mobilize the dissemination of IYOR 2008 for ICRI. These have developed “plans of action” where sustainable tourism is one of the major themes prioritized by the ICRI secretariat.

The following activities were suggested to ITF-STD members in support of the campaign:

- To nominate an IYOR point of contact from their organization to spread the word about IYOR 2008;
- To link IYOR 2008 to existing initiatives and/ or new initiatives; and
- To disseminate the information tools and guidelines that have been developed.

The calendar events that were announced include:

- The ICRI General Meeting in Washington, DC from 22-24 January 2008; and
- ICRI will be holding a Caribbean regional workshop on sustainable tourism directly following the ICRI meeting in July 2008, further information can be found with the ICRI secretariat.

Mr. Brohdag closed the session and highlighted that the Task Force has started to deliver concrete outputs towards the development of sustainable consumption and production patterns in the tourism sector. He explained that these outputs are related with the projects financed by the French government but have also contributed to projects that started within the Task Force’s programme of work and implemented by various partners.

THIRD DAY

PARRALLEL SESSION 1:

The morning session continued with the delivery of country presentations on national and/or regional strategic approaches on sustainable tourism development by Norway, Brazil, SICA, EU and Costa Rica. The discussions after these presentations have been documented under the minutes for day 2. This was followed by the presentation on the International Year of the Reef 2008.

PARRALLEL SESSION 2:

The third meeting day aimed at fostering discussion amongst ITF-STD members on policy recommendations that could be submitted to the CSD for review under the Marrakech process. Recalling the ITF-STD's programme of work; presentations were delivered on the four thematic areas of work; these include: (1) tourism and climate change; (2) tourism and biodiversity; (3) tourism and natural and cultural heritage; and (4) tourism and local sustainable development.

FIRST PRESENTATION: TOURISM AND CLIMATE CHANGE

Mr. Cabrini (UNWTO) presented the results of the report on tourism and climate change that was commissioned to a group of international team experts by UNWTO, UNEP and WMO. Based on the report, he summarized the state of knowledge in four main areas that represent the new realities of tourism in an era of global climate change, these include: (1) the impacts and adaptations at tourism destinations; (2) the implications for tourism demand; (3) the emissions from tourism; and (4) the mitigation measures in tourism.

The key findings that were presented highlighted the following:

- Climate change and mitigation is expected to affect the main attractions of a destination (climate, natural environment, personal safety and travel costs) especially at regional level;
- The media and the information provided on the impacts of climate change will influence tourism perceptions and their destination choices;
- The tourism industry must adapt to climate change in order to minimize risks and capitalize on new opportunities in a sustainable way;
- International and domestic tourism emissions from three main sub-sectors (transport, accommodation and tourism activities) are estimated to represent 5% of global emissions;
- Mitigation strategies in the tourism sector are needed and should primarily focus on energy efficiency and sequestering CO₂ emissions; and
- Knowledge advancement and research development is needed with the cooperation of the industry.

The following recommendations were made:

- The need to improve knowledge on the impacts of climate change on tourism with the aim of assisting the media in providing accurate information to the consumer;
- The need to improve knowledge on the capacity of the tourism industry to adapt to climate change;
- The need for international organizations, public administrations and the tourism industry to include adaptation and mitigation measures in policy and management responses; and
- The need to support the development of new technological mechanisms for the tourism sector to implement mitigation strategies that focus on energy efficiency.

SECOND PRESENTATION-TOURISM AND BIODIVERSITY:

Mr. Fotiou (UNEP) presented the importance of biodiversity as a vital asset for the tourism industry. He underlined two main issues: (1) the importance of decreasing the ecological footprint of tourism; and (2) the potential to optimize the use of tourism as a tool for biodiversity conservation. He highlighted the potential role of the ITF-STD to strengthen the implementation of existing principles and guidelines. The presentation focused on the CBD guidelines on biodiversity and tourism development.

The presentation raised the following key questions on how the ITF-STD can contribute to strengthen the implementation of the CBD guidelines:

- The way in which the TF can use their networks and cooperation platforms to promote the guidelines;

- To develop links between environmental, cultural and tourism administrations;
- To advocate the use of the guidelines in National Tourism Administrations (NTAs), the private sector, local communities; and
- To recommend capacity building activities that can strengthen the implementation of the guidelines.

Recommendation actions the ITF-STD can undertake to strengthen the implementation of the CBD guidelines were suggested and included:

- Implementing a payment mechanism for ecosystem services to ensure that the private sector takes responsibility for the affects of tourism activities on biodiversity; and
- Implementing mechanisms to protect biodiversity while providing economic benefits to the surrounding community.

Jean Luc Michaud, President of the French National Committee on Sustainable Tourism Development, introduced the publication on best practices on sustainable tourism development in France. It was developed by the French Ministry in charge of Tourism, the Ministry for Ecology, Sustainable Development and Spatial Planning, and published by ODIT France.

THIRD PRESENTATION-TOURISM AND NATURAL AND CULTURAL HERITAGE:

Arthur Pederson, Director of the World Heritage Center at UNESCO presented the monumental value of natural and cultural heritage sites for the promotion of tourism. He expressed the importance of managing tourism at these sites and highlighted the main management challenge: the inadequate implementation of tourism/ public use plans at the site.

He stressed the need for the following actions:

- The need for protected areas and ministries of tourism to adopt a manual produced by IUCN and ICOMOS for onsite management;
- The need to train public use coordinators on site management and to improve communication at industry level;
- The need to facilitate dialogue between the Ministry of Tourism, the Ministry of Culture and the Ministry of Environment;
- The need for poverty alleviation programmes linked to economic independence and site conservation improvement;
- The need for regional development through the support of small businesses;
- The need to familiarize TO and hotels to the existence of cultural and natural heritage products;
- The need to encourage awareness raising through partnerships;
- The need to build local pride within the community through education; and
- The need to implement guidelines for tourism flow management in sites where the local people live.

FOURTH PRESENTATION- TOURISM AND LOCAL SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT:

Alain Laurent, Consultant to MAEE, presented the importance of tourism for local community development. He noted that tourism development depends on the public services and internal natural and human resources available on the territory. He stressed that the local administration has a significant role in creating favorable conditions for tourism development. He highlighted that the attractiveness of the site and the accessibility into the region are important factors. He explained the significance of clustering tourism products within a territory to enhance the territories competitiveness. He also mentioned that tourism development at local level must be developed

taking a systematic approach. The approach needs the support of actions taken at individual, local, territorial and global levels.

Challenges experienced by taking a territorial approach for sustainable tourism development were highlighted as follows:

- The need for local authorities to create rules and regulations on sustainable tourism development;
- The need to reinforce local authority capacities and to improve the local conditions for tourism development with the aim of increasing foreign exchange.

He said that sustainable tourism can be developed as a strategy for poverty alleviation if links are created between actions taken during all development stages, starting from the local level to the global level.

Ugo Toselli from Comite 21 presented local agenda 21 as a useful tool for authorities to implement and to develop sustainable tourism at local level.

Mr. Brodhag closed the session underlying the need to focus on the development of specific recommendations. In this respect, he recommended developing collaborative pilot projects engaging task force members, which directly support the implementation of sustainable tourism development on the ground and simultaneously demonstrate the economic and social benefits of this approach, to increase support for this model and inform the design and implementation of the 10 YFP on SCP under the Marrakech Process.

CLOSING REMARKS:

In the final session on Wednesday afternoon, 12 December, Mr. Christian Brodhag and Mr. Arab Hoballah, Head of Sustainable Consumption, and Production Branch at UNEP/DTIE presented preliminary conclusions of the meeting.

Mr. Brodhag noted that the work of the ITF-STD has proven to contribute to projects that started within the Task Force's programme of work and implemented by various partners. He said that the meeting served as an opportunity to further explore areas of synergy and to develop new initiatives. He also stated that the meeting was an opportunity to focus on the experience of participating countries on the usefulness of the sustainable tourism projects currently being implemented. He highlighted that this sharing of national experiences will help the Task Force to reflect on the key elements and policy tools that are needed, by each country, at national level to maximize the coordination necessary to achieve sustainable tourism development. He stated that the participation of financing agencies and donors in this meeting has created a very good momentum for match-making between "financial sources" and "development demands" in the tourism sector under a framework of sustainable development.

Mr. Hoballah highlighted that the work of the ITF-STD in developing pilot projects, networking, and developing tools serve in a very good way the main objective of the Marrakech process, which is the promotion of sustainable consumption and production through concrete actions. He said that the meeting has also proved that responsible investment and financing is a corner stone for sustainable tourism development.

He stressed that the SIFT initiative could be used as an opportunity for the following:

- Creating a network on Sustainable Investment and Financing in Tourism with the participation of multi-lateral and bi-lateral donors, financing institutions, the private sector (banks, tourism companies, and investors), developing countries and international organisations.
- Providing guidance to public authorities at national and local levels in constructing the

appropriate policy frameworks to complement and stimulate the channeling of financial resources necessary for sustainable tourism development.

In reference to the development of sustainable tourism development contributing to poverty alleviation, he stressed the need to focus attention on business development patterns that can serve this objective. He recalled that the conservation of biodiversity, one of the main assets of tourism development, should also be a primary focus of any tourism project and investment.

He emphasized that activities towards adaptation and mitigation measures to combat climate change in the tourism sector should be strengthened. He said that the development of policy and business guidelines should be considered as one of the most visible and valuable activities of the Task Force. In this respect he encouraged the following activities:

- The compilation of a global baseline of sustainable tourism criteria;
- Work on the integration of sustainable tourism in governance and local development approaches;
- The compilation of good practices and the need to focus on the development of specific recommendations. In this respect he recommended:
- The development of collaborative pilot projects engaging task force members, which directly support the implementation of sustainable tourism development on the ground and simultaneously demonstrate the economic and social benefits of this approach, to increase support for this model and inform the design and implementation of the 10 YFP on SCP under the Marrakech Process.

He stressed the importance of building upon the experience that the task force creates and the need to mainstream the sustainability principles and guidelines in all forms of tourism.

Regarding upcoming events, Mali's representatives announced that the third edition of the International Forum on Solidary Tourism and Fair Trade (FITS Mali) will take place in Mali and in various countries in the region from 16-22 of October 2008.

The Malian authorities wish to promote tourism that allows the distribution of benefits to the local communities and the promotion of national cultural assets. This forum, supported by France, will serve as an opportunity to exchange good practices and methodological approaches on sustainable tourism working towards poverty alleviation.

Mr. Carlos Benavides, Minister for Tourism in Costa Rica expressed his gratification in having participated in the Third International Task Force Meeting on Sustainable Tourism Development. He described the Task Force as a forum where new paths for sustainable development can be discovered through the exchange of challenges and achievement. He congratulated the French government for its hospitality and for its co-organization of the meeting. He highlighted the important role of France in teaching the international community a lesson with the implementation of the "Grenelle of the Environment". He said that Costa Rica shares the concern of France and its determination of being a key role player in the necessary changes that must be embraced by the international community to achieve sustainable development. He recalled that climate change has become a critical challenge for humanity and is being recognized at the core of every strategy and analysis. He underlined the pressing need for all countries to implement mitigation measures against climate change taking into consideration the need to combat poverty and achieve sustainable development. In this respect, he said that the Costa Rica experience demonstrates that tropical developing countries can design different mechanism to promote reforestation and forest management. He also shared with the task force members the Principles of Peace with Nature, which calls on all countries of the world to combat against environmental degradation in a joint effort through the implementation of actions in the public and private sector together with the civil society.

He proposed the endorsement of this initiative as a Task Force and to use the experience of the ITF members for its validation. He officially announced that the next ITF-STD Meeting will be held in Costa Rica during the second trimester of 2008.

Mr. Luc Chatel, French Secretary of State for Consumer Affairs and Tourism officially closed the meeting. He highlighted that the Task Force has gained strong cooperation from its country members at international and national level. They have demonstrated their willingness to participate in the pilot projects implemented by the French Government, UNEP, OECD, UNWTO, UNDP and other NGOs. He underlined the need to now engage the finance sector to support the effective coordination of efforts to promote sustainable tourism development. He stressed the importance of sharing the work of the Task Force with other countries to promote sustainable consumption and production patterns globally. He recognized the importance of the tourism sector and its global development impacts while stressing the need for tourism destinations to conserve their natural assets as a competitive advantage. In this sense, he highlighted the need to continue work on the education and capacity building of the tourism sector to increase awareness of the impacts of tourism on the environment and biodiversity. He stressed the need for all actors in the tourism industry at country level to work together towards sustainable tourism development. He also said that strong national and international public opinion will help mobilize these efforts.